

MINUTES
MEETING OF THE SAN DIEGO METROPOLITAN TRANSIT SYSTEM
BOARD OF DIRECTORS

November 9, 2023

[Clerk's note: Except where noted, public, staff and board member comments are paraphrased. The full comment can be heard by reviewing the recording at the [MTS website](#).]

1. Roll Call

Chair Whitburn called the Board meeting to order at 9:04 a.m. A roll call sheet listing Board member attendance is attached.

2. Public Comment

Louis Pruitt – Provided a verbal statement to the Board during the meeting. Louis asked that the time be displayed on Variable Message Signs (VMS). Louis asked that the agency instate a 901 express bus service and that the agency eliminate the Sunday schedule. Sharon Cooney, MTS Chief Executive Officer, connected Louis Pruitt to Denis Desmond, MTS Director of Planning.

Alex Wong – Representing Ride SD made a verbal statement to the Board during the meeting. Alex supported the agency's proposal to increase trolley frequency to support the University City population.

Truth – Provided a verbal statement to the Board during the meeting. Truth did not believe that security enforcement was effective.

SPECIAL ITEM

3. Appointment of Ad Hoc Nominating Committee for Recommending Appointments to MTS Committees for 2024 (Sharon Cooney)

Action would appoint an Ad Hoc Nominating Committee to make recommendations to the Board with respect to the appointment of the Chair Pro-Tem as well as MTS and non-MTS committees for 2024.

Public Comment

Truth – Provided a verbal statement to the Board during the meeting. Truth stated that they did not believe Board Members deserved to serve on the Board.

Board Member Comment

Chair Whitburn noted that up to seven members can join the committee to comply with Brown Act rules.

Action on Recommended Consent Items

Board Member Hall moved to solicit committee volunteers. Board Member Elo-Rivera, Board Member Gastil, Chair Whitburn, Board Member Dillard, Board Member Hall and Board Member Donovan volunteered to participate in the Ad Hoc Nominating Committee to make recommendations to the Board with respect to the appointment of the Chair Pro-Tem as well as MTS and non-MTS committees for 2024. Board Member Dillard seconded the motion, and the vote was 11 to 0 in favor with Board Member McCann, Board Member Vargas, Board Member Bush and Board Member Moreno absent.

CONSENT ITEMS:

4. Approval of Minutes

Action would approve the October 19, 2023 Board of Directors meeting minutes.

5. Adoption of the 2024 San Diego Metropolitan Transit System (MTS) Executive Committee and Board of Directors Meeting Schedule

Action would adopt the 2024 Executive Committee and Board of Directors meeting schedule

6. Repeal of MTS Board Policy No. 24, "Regional Transit Service Dispute Resolution"

Action would repeal MTS Board Policy No. 24, "Regional Transit Service Dispute Resolution" as of January 1, 2024.

7. Quarter Ending September 30, 2023 – Investment Report

8. Pay Phone Services – Contract Award

Action would authorize the Chief Executive Officer (CEO) to: (1) Execute MTS Doc. No. L1462.0-23 (in substantially the same format as Attachment A), with Western Automated Solutions, Inc. ("Wescomm"), for the provision of pay phone services for one and a half (1.5) base years with four (4), one (1)-year options for a total of \$1,362,900.00; and (2) Exercise the option years at the CEO's discretion.

9. Bus Operator and Supervisor Uniforms – Contract Award

Action would authorize the Chief Executive Officer (CEO) to execute MTS Doc. No. B0756.0-23, with Bordova Innovations Inc., for the purchase of bus operator and supervisor uniforms, for five (5) years effective January 1, 2024 through December 31, 2028, in the amount of \$2,612,786.76.

10. Railroad Ties – Contract Award

Action would authorize the Chief Executive Officer (CEO) to execute MTS Doc No. L1651.0-24, with Phoenix Contracting in the amount of \$182,700.90 for railroad ties.

11. Heating, Ventilation and Air Conditioning (HVAC) Preventative Inspection and Maintenance Services and As-Needed Repairs – Contract Award

Action would authorize the Chief Executive Officer (CEO) to: 1) Execute MTS Doc. No. PWG372.0-23, with Comfort Mechanical, Inc., a Small Business (SB), for HVAC preventative inspection and maintenance services and as-needed repairs for a three (3) year base period, with two (2) 1-year options for a total of \$715,596.93; and 2) Exercise the option years at the CEO's discretion.

12. Davra Network RuBAN Software Support and Development – Sole Source Contract Award

Action would authorize the Chief Executive Officer (CEO) to: 1) Execute MTS Doc. No. G2795.0-24, with Davra Networks (Davra), in the amount of \$1,288,800.00, for a period of three (3) base years, and two (2) one-year options for the provision of RuBAN software licensing support and development; and 2) Exercise the option years at the CEO's discretion.

13. Janitorial Services – Contract Amendment

Action would 1) Ratify Amendment 4 to MTS Doc. No. G2613.4-22 with NMS Management Inc. (NMS), a Disadvantage Business Enterprise (DBE), in the amount of \$13,316.30; and 2) Authorize the Chief Executive Officer (CEO) to execute Amendment 5 to MTS Doc. No. G2613.5-22 with NMS, in the amount of \$274,423.08.

14. Landscape Maintenance Services – Contract Amendment

Action would 1) Ratify Amendment 2 to MTS Doc No. PWG302.2-20 with Aztec Landscaping, Inc. (Aztec) in the amount of \$50,000.00 for as-needed landscaping services at multiple Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) locations; 2) Ratify Amendment 3 to MTS Doc No. PWG302.4-20 with Aztec, at no additional cost, for as-needed landscaping services at the Pyramid Building; and 3) Ratify Amendment 4 to MTS Doc No. PWG302.4-20 with Aztec in the amount of \$26,877.00 for as-needed landscaping services for the channel clearing of nonnative, invasive, and channel blocking landscaping in the Alvarado Creek near Grantville Transit Center, and to San Diego River property near Hotel Circle for as needed landscaping services for the Land Management (LM) program; and 4) Authorize the Chief Executive Officer (CEO) to execute Amendment 5 to MTS Doc No. PWG302.5-20 with Aztec in the amount of \$100,083.00 for as-needed landscaping services for the Coronado track line and Palomar station cleanups for the LM program.

15. Baltimore Junction and Euclid Avenue Planning Study – Work Order Agreement

Action would authorize the Chief Executive Officer (CEO) to execute Work Order WOA355-AE-32 under MTS Doc. No. PWL355.0-22 (in substantially the same format as Attachment A) with Psomas, in the amount of \$699,915.43 to provide planning services for the Baltimore Junction and Euclid Avenue Grade Separation Study.

16. Federal Fiscal Year (FFY) 2022 Federal Transit Administration (FTA) Section 5310 Enhanced Mobility for Seniors and Individuals with Disabilities (FTA Section 5310) – Amended and Restated Grant Award

Action would: (1) Authorize the Chief Executive Officer (CEO) to execute amended and restated grant agreement, MTS Doc. No. G2697.1-23 (in substantially the same format as Attachment A), awarded by the San Diego Association of Governments (SANDAG) in the amount of \$599,999.00 in FFY 2022 FTA Section 5310 funding for paratransit vehicle replacement; and (2) Authorize \$693,076.42 in local matching funds to fully fund the purchase of seven (7) Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) paratransit vehicles.

17. Mills Building 1st Floor Security Breakroom and Transit Store Office Rehabilitation – Change Order

Action would authorize the Chief Executive Officer (CEO) to execute Change Order (CCO) 02 to Work Order MTSJOC324-18.02 under Job Order Contract (JOC) MTS Doc. No. PWG324.0-21 (in substantially the same format as Attachment A) with ABC General Contracting, Inc. (ABCGC), in the amount of \$100,497.50, for replacing the Heating, Ventilation and Air Conditioning (HVAC) serving the new MTS Security Field Office and Transit Store Office at the Mills Building, as well as providing and installing additional access controls and Closed-Circuit Television (CCTV) systems.

18. Operations Budget Status Report for September 2023

Public Comment for Consent Items

Truth – Provided a verbal statement to the Board during the meeting. Truth provided comments on items 5, 6, 8, 9, 13, 15 and expressed: (5) dissatisfaction with the meeting start time, (6) that SANDAG would be consolidated with MTS, (8) dissatisfaction with project funding allocations, (9) dissatisfaction with operator uniform cost, (13) dissatisfaction with cleaning costs, and (15) dissatisfaction with funding allocations to the project assessment rather than safety.

Alex Wong – Representing Ride SD made a verbal statement to the Board during the meeting. Alex provided a comment for item 15 and suggested a flying junction rather than the proposed Y-junction and discouraged additional interlining.

Board Member Comment for Consent Item 15

Board Member Montgomery Steppe acknowledged the planning study as a victory for the Council District and commended MTS for addressing the region. She also acknowledged the removal of trees on the Orange Line and the positive community impacts the projects will bring to the region.

Action on Recommended Consent Items 4-18

Board Member Montgomery Steppe moved to approve Consent Agenda Item Nos. 4 to 18. Board Member Dillard seconded the motion, and the vote was 12 to 0 in favor with Board Member McCann, Board Member Vargas and Board Member Bush absent.

DISCUSSION ITEMS AND REPORT ITEMS:

19. SANDAG Report on Airport Transit Connection (Ryan Kohut, SANDAG)

Ryan Kohut, SANDAG's Strategic Projects Director, presented on the SANDAG Report on Airport Transit Connection. He outlined: the background, ATC concept study, light rail and automated people mover options, enhanced bus service, overall ridership, capital costs, potential funding source, key findings and next steps.

Public Comment

Alexandra Alderman – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Ancel Thompson – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Angie Wilcox – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Barbara Dewitt – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Bobby Blackmon – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Bonnie Allen – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

C. M. Smith – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Cesar Dabdoub – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Maria Luisa Estrada Gomez – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Ghassan Abdo – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Greg Moraes – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

HJ Weiss – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Jim Haindrake – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Joyce Swett – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Kimberly Feith – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Anonymous – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Maria Carrera – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Monica Thrasher – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Morgan Paxhia – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Neal and Charlene Belitsky – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Paul Motenko – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Robert A. Greenes – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Robert Algeni – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Roger W. Storer – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Sharon Ryan – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Tali barzilai – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Ann Marie Malino – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Elizabeth Fulton – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

William C Hayes & Shirley Liu – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Emily Arcia – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

J.B Menaka & Vonetta Menaka – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Michael J. Leslie – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Rudy Moravick – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Susan Crenshaw – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Tim Krubsack – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Woon-Wah Siu – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Barbara B Lowenthal – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Elaine M. Regan – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

James M. Nathenson – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Mark S. Regan – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Sany Kremer – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

E Jack Phelps – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Shauna MacKay – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Steve Kohn – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Ronald Wong – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Rebecca Vesterfelt – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Andreina Diez – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

John and Christine Wenzel – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Rick & Lynette Locatelli – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Shian-Shi Yao – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Simitha Singh Rambiritch – Provided a written statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet.

Janet Rogers – Representing the Train Coalition provided a written and verbal statement to the Board during the meeting. The written comment is provided in the November 9, 2023 Final Meeting Packet. Janet provided a presentation to the Board and listed: the coalition's support for the extension of the existing trolley line to the airport, identified problems with Automated People Mover (APM), APM south leg option relative to trolley lines, APM city examples, various trolley extension possibilities, project cost comparison, project alternative. Janet did not support the APM and supported the trolley expansion.

Bill Rogers – A resident of Downtown San Diego made a verbal statement to the Board during the meeting. Bill did not support the APM and supported the trolley expansion.

Ann Marie Maline – A resident of Downtown San Diego made a verbal statement to the Board during the meeting. Ann did not support the APM and supported the trolley expansion as it would be duplicative to existing trolley infrastructure.

Paul Ceci – A resident of Downtown San Diego made a verbal statement to the Board during the meeting. Paul did not support the APM and supported the trolley expansion as it would be duplicative to existing trolley infrastructure. Paul believed that the expansion to the airport would allow MTS to service other neighboring communities. Paul did not support the infrastructure that the people mover would create.

Gary Malino – A resident of Downtown San Diego made a verbal statement to the Board during the meeting. Gary did not support the APM and supported the trolley expansion. Gary did not believe that APM would be able to support the frequency claims.

Pat Ransil – A resident of Downtown San Diego made a verbal statement to the Board during the meeting. Pat did not support the APM and supported the trolley expansion and asked for further trolley study options.

James Hoffmann – A resident of Downtown San Diego made a verbal statement to the Board during the meeting. James did not support the APM and supported the trolley expansion.

Monica Thrasher – Provided a verbal statement to the Board during the meeting. Monica did not support the APM and supported the trolley expansion.

Stephen Kohn – A resident of Downtown San Diego made a verbal statement to the Board during the meeting. They did not support the APM and supported the trolley expansion. Stephen believed the people mover would be an eye sore.

Paul Herstein – A resident of Downtown San Diego made a verbal statement to the Board during the meeting. Paul did not support the APM and supported the trolley integrated expansion. Paul cited city case studies as failures of people movers.

Truth – Provided a verbal statement to the Board during the meeting. Truth did not support the APM.

Alex Wong – Representing Ride SD made a verbal statement to the Board during the meeting. Alex did not support the trolley expansion and noted frequency as a benefit of an APM.

Board Member Comments

Board Member Moreno recalled that the original intent of the airport connection was to connect the central mobility hub. She asked if the connection was no longer part of the project's priorities. Mr. Kohut replied that they were separate projects and that the airport connection decision will inform a Mobility Hub decision later on. Board Member Moreno asked staff to clarify why the South leg was a preferred option over the Trolley. She explained that the Trolley has a lower capital cost and a similar level of ridership to justify federal grants. She asked staff to clarify why the Trolley extension was not the preferred option in EIR studies. Mr. Kohut replied that the South Leg APM offers more frequency, additional operating cost clarification is needed and the agency intends on assessing the Trolley feasibility more in the environmental review process. The concept study allowed the agency to look at a wide selection of options to serve the region, and study results suggested that there is a need too connect the airport to the downtown urban core. This area serves about 9,400 airport employees that live in the southern part of the region. Board Member Moreno added that the airport workforce may live in the south San Diego region or in Mexico. Mr. Kohut added that this system is meant to serve both travelers and airport employees. Board Member Moreno listed the six stations that the people mover would serve and noted that of those six, only two would be different than the current MTS stations. She asked staff if it was duplicative to extend the APM stations that already have Trolley services. Mr. Kohut replied that SANDAG aims to create the most robust connection possible, which means creating as much cohesive connectivity as possible.

Vice Chair Goble stated that the connection is built for travelers. He noted that the people mover accommodated space for luggage. He also noted that from a capital cost stand point, the people mover should integrate with the Trolley system rather than having separate infrastructure. Vice Chair Goble added that currently, the Trolley runs at ground level, which would make boarding and de-boarding with luggage easier, compared to an elevated platform. He stated that Trolley integration would allow communities from various regions to connect to the airport on one

system and paying one fare. He acknowledged tourism traffic from the convention center to a rental car station, and believed that the shorter capital constriction would yield the smaller cost. Integration, customer convenience, cost and visual impact should determine what transportation is used.

Board Member Hall asked staff to list the benefits to the Trolley that extended beyond speed. Mr. Kohut replied that frequency was the biggest driver that favored the APM project. He noted that separate systems allow for constraint freedoms from the existing system and the potential for decline in reliability. While Mr. Kohut noted that the Trolley service frequency would change to 7.5-minute headways, and headway changes would make the grade crossing gate down time in the downtown area change from 15 minutes up to 25 minutes per hour. Adding service to the airport could add 30-35-minute gate down time per hour. Board Member Hall did not support the APM option and suggested Trolley cars could be configured to accommodate luggage. Board Member Hall noted that if the Trolley was selected for this project, additional Trolley stops could become options in neighboring areas to the airport. He did not support the people mover because of the additional infrastructure cost and accessibility issues to use the system.

Board Member Elo-Rivera recommended that SANDAG staff present on features that would directly benefit the MTS transportation system. He noted that accessibility can be defined many ways, and SANDAG's perspective seems to focus on frequency. Mr. Kohut replied that SANDAG aims to serve a fast, reliable and efficient connection to the airport to serve time-dependent air travelers and employees. An APM could serve the existing transit system. Board Member Elo-Rivera acknowledged the importance of airport workers as the primary beneficiaries of an efficient, dignified way to get to and from work.

Board Member Gastil acknowledged the value MTS would receive from regularity and reliability of the connections to serve employees and choice riders. He supported the study showcasing various options for the connection. Board Member Gastil did not believe that there was an issue with this redundant infrastructure, and would rather create reliability.

Chair Whitburn stated that a 2-4-minute vs a 7-minute headway is less important in route to the airport. He acknowledged recurrent public rhetoric themes where they want easy, simple and convenient transit. He noted that this can be achieved by keeping transportation to the airport on one system. He also noted San Diego's natural beauty to protect the visual corridor so that residents can enjoy the City. He asked if visual impacts would be part of the environmental study. Mr. Kohut replied that in the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA), environmental processes demand that visual impacts are incorporated into the report. He assured the Board that the APM systems are smaller and quieter, they require less infrastructure and can be threaded through buildings. Chair Whitburn stated that as the Downtown Councilmember, he would prefer that APMs are not threaded through buildings.

Action Taken

Informational item only. No action taken.

20. Fiscal Year 2023 Annual Comprehensive Financial Report (ACFR) (Erin Dunn With Ken Pun and Coley Delaney of the Pun Group)

Erin Dunn, MTS Controller, introduced Ken Pun and Coley Delaney of the Pun Group who presented on the FY 23 ACFR. They presented on: management and auditors' responsibilities,

overview of the financial statements, key pension and Other Postemployment Benefits Plan (OPEB) information and audit results.

Public Comment

Truth – Provided a verbal statement to the Board during the meeting. Truth acknowledged fare box recovery percent discrepancies between SANDAG and MTS. Truth advocated for rider safety and previous satisfactory percentages as false.

Board Member Comment

Vice Chair Goble asked a series of questions related to the audit process. He directed the following questions to the auditor: during the audit, were you given access to any employee you needed to talk to for the purposes of preparing the audit? Mr. Pun responded yes. He asked: did you ever ask for access to an employee that you felt necessary to complete your audit and were denied access to that employee? Mr. Pun responded no. He asked: were you given full access to any documents including ledgers, financial statements, and financial documents for the purpose of conducting the audit? Mr. Pun responded yes. He asked: did you ever ask for any documents, ledgers, or financial documents from staff or executives that were refused to be provided to you? Mr. Pun responded no. He asked: did you find any financial practices being used by staff or executives to not be consistent with the best practices of accounting? Mr. Pun responded no. He asked: is it your opinion that this audit and MTS's financial record keeping deserves an unmodified opinion? Mr. Pun responded yes. He asked: what is the alternative to an unmodified opinion? Mr. Pun responded that if he was not be able to issue an unmodified opinion there would be either a qualified opinion, adverse opinion, or disclaimer of an opinion. He assured the Board that MTS received an unmodified opinion, which means that the financial reporting is in accordance with general accounting principles. He asked: how many years has your company been conducting financial audits for MTS? Mr. Pun responded approximately 18-19 years. Lastly, he asked: have you ever found an MTS audit that you did not ultimately conclude that it would be an unmodified opinion? Mr. Pun responded no.

Ms. Cooney recognized MTS Finance staff (Erin Dunn, Craig Auker and Jennifer Pentoney) for achieving the 17th year in a row achievement of excellent financial reporting from the Government Finance Officers Association.

Action Taken

Vice Chair Goble moved to receive the Fiscal Year 2023 ACFR. Chair Whitburn seconded the motion, and the vote was 12 to 0 in favor with Board Member McCann, Board Member Vargas and Board Member Bush absent.

21. Fiscal Year (FY) 2023 Final Operating Budget Results (Gordon Meyer)

Gordon Meyer, MTS Manager of Financial Planning and Analysis, presented on FY 2023 Final Operating Budget Results. He outlined the following information: total operating revenues, expenses, activities, subsidy revenue category descriptions, total non-operating revenues and expenses, total revenues less expenses, contingency reserve balance and staff recommendation.

Public Comment

Truth – Provided a verbal statement to the Board during the meeting. Truth expressed dissatisfaction with MTS.

Board Member Comment

Board Member Gastil asked why the agency targets a 12.5% reserve and why that is the most effective goal for MTS. Larry Marinesi, MTS Chief Financial Officer discussed extensive conversations with the Board in previous years, and noted the figure was changed from an originally proposed 10% to 12.5%.

Action Taken

Vice Chair Goble moved to receive the MTS operations budget status report for FY 2023 and approve staff recommendations for programming excess revenues less expenses. Board Member Hall seconded the motion, and the vote was 12 to 0 in favor with Board Member McCann, Board Member Vargas and Board Member Bush absent.

22. MTS Support Services Overview (Amanda Denham)

Amanda Denham, MTS Director of Support Services, presented on MTS Support Services Overview. She outlined the following items: overview of support services, customer service, information & trip planning, PRONTO support center, MTS transit store, passenger support team, ride check program, data driven and collaboration, and the dedicated team.

Public Comment

Truth – Provided a verbal statement to the Board during the meeting. Truth expressed skepticism to MTS cleanliness and security practices. Truth expressed dissatisfaction with MTS.

Board Member Comments

Vice Chair Goble noted the cleaning schedule and practices as a benefit to the public.

Board Member Aguirre asked about the Ride Check Program. She asked if the program captured general suggestions and if the Board could have access to that data annually. Ms. Denham replied that data from the program is in a set form that is processed through the customer service team, independent from customer feedback. She clarified that ride checkers are to evaluate the system from a customer perspective with no leading context as to what to audit. These evaluations are looked at in conjunction with Customer Feedback reporting. She assured the Board that the data could be shared. Board Member Aguirre encouraged the report being shared with the Board.

Board Member Chavez commended the Customer Service team for their 17 second call wait time. She asked if the department collected public security data. Ms. Denham replied that the department has the capacity to sort the data by various modes. Board Member Chavez noted that they would like to have access to the data.

Action Taken

No action taken. Informational item only.

23. Fiscal Year (FY) 2023 Annual Performance Monitoring and Operating Reports (Denis Desmond, Neomi Woods, Mike Wygant, and Brian Riley)

Denis Desmond, MTS Director of Planning, presented on FY 2023 annual performance monitoring report. He presented on: Policy 42 evaluation criteria, total passengers, weekday average, monthly passengers, passengers per revenue hour, on-time performance, farebox

recovery and youth opportunity pass. Mike Wygant Chief Operating Officer of Bus outlined transit services safety, safety highlights, transit services, capital projects, Zero Emission Bus (ZEB), Rapid 227, fleet highlights, MTS access services, support services, and ZEB con. Brian Riley, Chief Operating Officer of Rail, presented on capital improvement projects, 5000-series vehicle commissioning, rail vehicle second-life program and rail safety and operations.

Public Comment

Truth – Provided a verbal statement to the Board during the meeting. Truth expressed dissatisfaction with the MTS Board and services.

Board Member Comment

Board Member Aguirre asked that MTS and City staff reassess Route 227 through Imperial Beach. She noted three stalled buses that were towed out of the City limits.

Action Taken

No action taken. Informational item only.

OTHER ITEMS:

24. Chair, Board Member and Chief Executive Officer's (CEO's) Communications and CEO Report

Board Member Comment

Board Member Gastil reminded the Board that the annual Facilitating Access to Coordinated Transportation (FACT) meeting would take place December 5, 2023. He acknowledged Ms. Cooney, Board Member Elo-Rivera and Councilmember Jack Shu as guest speakers at the event.

Public Comment

Truth – Provided a verbal statement to the Board during the meeting. Truth expressed dissatisfaction with MTS contracts and public comment time allotment.

25. Remainder of Public Comments Not on The Agenda

There was no Chief Executive Officer's Report.

27. Next Meeting Date

The next regularly scheduled Board meeting is December 14, 2023 at 9:00 a.m.

CLOSED SESSION (TAKEN OUT OF ORDER):

The Board convened to Closed Session at 12:00 p.m.

26. Closed Session – Conference with Real Property Negotiators Pursuant to California Government Code Section 54956.8

1313 and 1344 National Avenue, San Diego, CA (APN 535-612-01 and 535-613-04)
Agency Negotiators: Sharon Cooney, Chief Executive Officer; Karen Landers, General Counsel; Heather Furey, Director of Capital Projects; Sean Myott, Manager of Real Estate Assets; Nicole White Forrest, San Diego Housing Fund; Susan Guinn, San Diego Foundation

Negotiating Parties: TBD
Under Negotiation: Price and Terms of Payment

Public Comment

Truth – Provided a verbal statement to the Board during the meeting. Truth asked for additional details listed for closed session items.

Closed Session Reconvening

The Board reconvened to Open Session at 12:22 p.m.

Karen Landers, General Counsel, reported the following oral report of final actions taken in Closed Session: The Board received a report and gave instructions to negotiators.

ADJOURNMENT

27. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 12:23 p.m.

/S/ Stephen Whitburn

Chairperson
San Diego Metropolitan Transit System

Filed by:

Approved as to form:

/S/ Dalia Gonzalez

Clerk of the Board
San Diego Metropolitan Transit System

/S/ Karen Landers

General Counsel
San Diego Metropolitan Transit
System

Attachment: Roll Call Sheet

SAN DIEGO METROPOLITAN TRANSIT SYSTEM
BOARD OF DIRECTORS
ROLL CALL

MEETING OF (DATE): November 9, 2023 CALL TO ORDER (TIME): 9:04 am
 RECESS: _____ RECONVENE: _____
 CLOSED SESSION: 12:00 pm RECONVENE: 12:22 pm
 PUBLIC HEARING: _____ RECONVENE: _____
 ORDINANCES ADOPTED: _____ ADJOURN: 12:23 pm

JURISDICTION	BOARD MEMBER		ALTERNATE		PRESENT (TIME ARRIVED)	ABSENT (TIME LEFT)
City of Chula Vista	Chavez	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Cardenas	<input type="checkbox"/>	9:11 am	12:23 pm
City of Chula Vista	McCann	<input type="checkbox"/>	Cardenas	<input type="checkbox"/>	ABSENT	ABSENT
City of Coronado	Donovan	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Duncan	<input type="checkbox"/>	9:04 am	12:23 pm
County of San Diego	Vacant	<input type="checkbox"/>	Vargas	<input type="checkbox"/>	ABSENT	ABSENT
City of El Cajon	Goble (Vice-Chair)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Ortiz	<input type="checkbox"/>	9:04 am	12:23 pm
City of Imperial Beach	Leyba-Gonzalez	<input type="checkbox"/>	Aguirre	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	9:04 am	12:23 pm
City of La Mesa	Dillard	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Arapostathis	<input type="checkbox"/>	9:04 am	12:23 pm
City of Lemon Grove	Gastil	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Mendoza	<input type="checkbox"/>	9:04 am	12:23 pm
City of National City	Bush	<input type="checkbox"/>	Rodriguez	<input type="checkbox"/>	ABSENT	ABSENT
City of Poway	Frank	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Pepin	<input type="checkbox"/>	9:04 am	12:23 pm
City of San Diego	Montgomery Steppe	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Von Wilpert	<input type="checkbox"/>	9:04 am	12:23 pm
City of San Diego	Elo-Rivera	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	LaCava	<input type="checkbox"/>	9:04 am	12:23 pm
City of San Diego	Gloria	<input type="checkbox"/>	Moreno	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	9:14 am	12:23 pm
City of San Diego	Whitburn (Chair)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Campillo	<input type="checkbox"/>	9:04 am	12:23 pm
City of Santee	Hall	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Koval Minto	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>	9:04 am	12:00pm

SIGNED BY THE CLERK OF THE BOARD: /S/ Dalia Gonzalez