

JOINT MEETING OF THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS FOR THE
METROPOLITAN TRANSIT SYSTEM (MTS),
SAN DIEGO TRANSIT CORPORATION (SDTC), AND
SAN DIEGO TROLLEY, INC. (SDTI)

March 9, 2006

Plaza Hall
202 C Street, San Diego

MINUTES

1. Roll Call

Chairman Mathis called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m. A roll call sheet listing Board member attendance is attached.

2. Approval of Minutes

Mr. Ewin moved to approve the minutes of the February 9, 2006, Board of Directors meeting. Mr. Emery seconded the motion, and the vote was 9 to 0 in favor.

3. Public Comment

Chairman Mathis moved this item to the end of the agenda.

5. Closed Session

None

CONSENT ITEMS

6. MTS: Contract Extension for Light Rail Vehicle Cleaning (OPS 960.6, PC 50641)

Recommend that the Board of Directors authorize the CEO to execute a temporary contract extension (in substantially the same format as Attachment A of the agenda item) with Calderon Building Maintenance for light rail vehicle cleaning services until such time that a consolidated, multiagency procurement can solicited and awarded.

7. MTS: Regional Scheduling System – Contract Amendment (CIP 10940)

Recommend that the Board of Directors (1) receive a report on the status of the Regional Scheduling System Project and identify the basis of staff's change order recommendations; (2) ratify Amendment No. 1 (MTS Doc. No. G0856.1-03) (Attachment A of the agenda item) to the GIRO, Inc. contract as executed by the CEO for an amount not to exceed \$13,200;

(3) authorize the CEO to execute Amendment No. 2 (Attachment B of the agenda item) to the GIRO, Inc. contract (MTS Doc. No. G0856.0-03), in an amount not to exceed \$56,272, with an MTS cost of \$44,486 and North County Transit District (NCTD) cost of \$11,786; and (4) authorize the CEO to execute Amendment No. 3 (Attachment C of the agenda item) to the GIRO, Inc. contract (MTS Doc. No. G0856.0-03), in an amount not to exceed \$56,881, with an MTS cost of \$38,187.84 and an NCTD cost of \$18,693.16.

8. MTS: State Transit Assistance (STA) Claim Amendment (FIN 340.2, PC 20201)

Recommend that the Board of Directors adopt Resolution No. 06-3 (Attachment A of the agenda item) approving the revised FY 2006 STA claim amendment.

9. MTS: Election to Fill Vacant Position of San Diego and Arizona Eastern (SD&AE) Railway Company Board Member (SDAE 710.1, PC 50771)

Recommend that the Board of Directors (1) receive the San Diego and Imperial Valley Railroad, Pacific Southwest Railway Museum Association, and Carrizo Gorge Railway, Inc. quarterly reports (Attachment A of the agenda item); (2) ratify actions taken by the SD&AE Railway Company Board of Directors at its meeting on February 15, 2006 (Attachment B of the agenda item); and (3) ratify and appoint Peter Jespersen as a Board Member, as recommended by the SD&AE Board to Directors, to replace Douglas Verity who retired.

Recommended Consent Items

Mr. Ewin moved to approve Consent Agenda Item Nos. 6, 7, 8, and 9. Ms. Atkins seconded the motion, and the vote was 10 to 0 in favor.

NOTICED PUBLIC HEARINGS

25. MTS: Public Hearing – Comprehensive Operational Analysis (COA) – Service Development Plan (SRTP 805.2, PC 20484)

Chairman Mathis opened the public hearing at 9:05 a.m.

Mr. Conan Cheung, Director of Planning and Performance Monitoring, explained that MTS conducted the COA primarily to achieve financial sustainability and to reconnect with its markets. He presented a map of the urban network service area, a visual depiction of the improvement of service frequencies that will result from the service changes, and a visual depiction of regional as well as corridor services. He also reviewed MTS's outreach efforts, which were started 15 months ago and included 25 community open houses and over 50 community meetings. He stated that the COA is comprised of the addition of community-based services, revisions to fixed-route proposals, and a recommendation regarding Americans with Disabilities (ADA) paratransit. He provided an update on staff's latest adjustments to Route Nos. 210, 854, 874/875, 856, and 833. He also reported that Route No. 20 will bypass Fashion Valley every other trip, which will reduce travel time on that route by 15 minutes. He stated that MTS will continue to monitor its service and make adjustments to meet changing demands. He reported that the annual subsidy savings that is projected to be realized as a result of this project is estimated at \$5 million. He added that MTS expects to lose about 2,000 riders but

gain 16,000 riders and an additional \$2 million in revenues as a result of the recommended service changes.

Chairman Mathis provided guidelines for public comment to follow.

Public Comment

General

Jimmy Parker (Gaslamp Quarter Association): Mr. Parker thanked staff for being accessible and open during this process. He added that he appreciated the efficiency MTS is trying to create and the reduction of traffic on Broadway that is expected as a result of these service changes.

Greg Snee (University of California – San Diego {UCSD}): Mr. Snee expressed UCSD's support of the COA recommendations. He added that MTS's operational goals are the same as UCSD's.

George Frank (Uptown Partnership, Inc.): Mr. Frank stated that the Uptown Partnership supports the COA. He added that they support limited stops and shuttle service in uptown.

Theresa Quiroz: Ms. Quiroz expressed her approval of the overall project and commended staff for going to extraordinary lengths to get as much input as possible from the everyday rider. She added that adjustments still need to be made; e.g. Route No. 14 needs to stop at the Grantville Trolley Station, Route No. 965 should be a full-time bus, and, because express buses from City Heights to downtown have been eliminated, travel times are too long.

Kevin Casey (Downtown San Diego Partnership): Ms. Casey applauded the COA and, more specifically, the relocation of buses to east of the trolley tracks and the reduction of the number of routes that travel down Broadway.

Route No. 210

James Masingill, Dan Stephens, Luis Chavez, Pamela Stevens, Thomas Avery (U.S. Navy and its employees), Ricky Logier, and Yen Hguyen: These speakers thanked MTS for reconsidering the complete elimination of Route No. 210 and for the changes to Route No. 20. Mr. Chavez suggested that MTS consider raising fares to cover costs and take remedial action prior to reaching a crisis stage. Ms. Stevens suggested adding one more trip to Route No. 210 for those who start work downtown at 9:00 a.m. Mr. Avery stated that the U.S. Navy provides its employees with a transit subsidy and would cover an increase in fares should MTS decide to implement one. He stated that Route No. 210 had standing room only in the evening, which is not safe. He asked if larger buses could be operated in this case. Mr. Logier added that raising the cost of a monthly pass would also be an option and stated that he utilizes the Navy transit voucher program.

Mr. Hguyen stated that Route No. 220 takes too long to reach downtown.

In response to a question from Mr. Roberts, Mr. Cheung stated that staff will be timing Route No. 921 to meet Route No. 20 for connection purposes. He stated that riders from Mira Mesa

can also take Route No. 150, which will run all day to downtown via I-5. He also explained that express routes are very expensive because they travel long distances with no passenger turnover. He stated that the third a.m. trip on Route No. 210 carries about 20 passengers, which is only half full, and costs about \$50,000 per year to operate.

General

Gary Papers (Centre City Development Corp {CCDC}): Mr. Papers stated that CCDC supports improvements in downtown transportation services. He stated that transit needs are being linked with transit-oriented development and smart growth.

Donna Frye: Council Member Frye stated that not all council members supported the recently approved CCDC plan for downtown. She pointed out that all development has to be reviewed from an environmental aspect. She stated that the recommendations within the COA will have an impact on development plans. She asked if the actions being considered today need to be reviewed under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). She also acknowledged the difficulty of MTS's job.

Clive Richard: Mr. Richard stated that overall the plan is a good one. He stated that it should increase ridership by providing limited-stop service, improved frequencies, and a rich network of Services. He expressed support for the recommended changes for Route Nos. 83 and 965. He stated there should be a North Park circulator.

Route No. 965

Mr. Cheung reported that this route carries 14.6 passengers per hour at a subsidy of \$4.36 per passengers. He stated that the City Heights portion of this route is more productive. In response to a question from Ms. Atkins, Mr. Cheung reported that Route No. 965 will run on 30- to 40-minute frequency with no weekend service. Mr. Cheung confirmed for Mr. Roberts that the community did purchase a smaller bus to be used in place of standard-size buses, which they did not like operating through their neighborhoods. He stated that the smaller bus will still be used – it will just be shifted to the City Heights portion of the route.

Katherine Vienna, Marilee Bland, Leane Marchese (Elder Help), Michael Liebers (provides board care in home), Steven Mendez, Maria Soto (McKinley Elementary), and Susan Christie: These individuals opposed the proposed changes. These speakers will have to walk further to access transit service and one of the speakers will be required to change schools. Mr. Liebers stated that seniors need more service during daylight hours. Ms. Marchese stated that a citizens committee group functioning under the direction of SANDAG recommended two shuttle routes. She stated that the recommendations being reviewed today include a shuttle for City Heights but not for North Park. She suggested restoring the plan for a North Park shuttle when funding becomes available. Mr. Mendez suggested a routing change and that frequency be reduced from 30 minutes to 60 minutes in an effort to improve productivity on this route rather than eliminating it altogether. He stated, if that doesn't work, then provide peak-hour service only. He stated that McKinley Elementary needs this service. Ms. Christie stated that this is a lifeline service. She stated that riders who will lose the North Park portion of the shuttle will be forced to use paratransit at a subsidy of \$40 per person.

Route No. 845

Joyce Grier: Ms. Grier opposed the recommended changes for this route. She requested increased service instead. She stated that the Saturday bus only runs every 60 minutes. She expressed concern for operators who may be losing their jobs.

Route No. 44

Judith MacLeod: Ms. MacLeod opposed the recommended changes for Route No. 44. She stated that bus service is needed to Via Las Cumbres.

Route Nos. 844/845/20

Eli-Ben Arazi (Poway Unified School District {PUSD}), Kathy Linch (Client of Community Options), Janice Pepin (PUSD Transition Program), Clinton Wolford (PUSD Transition Program), and Barbara Hicke: Ms. Linch read a letter written by a client of Community Options, Carey Chase, who was unable to attend. The letter detailed the difficulties this individual would experience if the recommended changes are approved. Other speakers discussed the impact this program will have on students in the PUSD Transition Program, who are trying to learn to live independently. Other speakers objected to the reduction in frequency and the increase in the number of transfers required to reach their destinations

Route Nos. 28, 40, 70, 830, and 965

Mr. Todd Enoria (representing Congresswoman Susan Davis): Mr. Enoria thanked staff for the great collaboration regarding Route No. 28 through Pt. Loma. He stated that their constituents have expressed concern regarding Route Nos. 40, 70, 830, and 965. He stated that some of the recommended changes will be a major step backward because of the loss of current connections between buses. He stated that there is an increasing amount of development either underway or being considered, and transit will be an important part of that.

Route No. 40

Russ Gibbon, Alan Wake, Jihad Sleiman, Sheila Corman, Florence Sablan, Jay Powell, and Julie Paulsen: Each of these speakers opposed the recommended changes for this route. Mr. Gibbon suggested raising fares on express routes rather than eliminating them. Ms. Corman indicated that she would be willing to pay a higher fare to maintain this service. Ms. Sablan commended operators for being courteous and friendly. Mr. Powell presented a letter from the El Cajon Boulevard Business Improvement Association and a petition to retain the Route No. 40 express service from the Navajo area to downtown. Ms. Paulsen felt that service reductions should be made to the whole system.

Staff Response

Mr. Devin Braun, Transit Operations Analyst, reported that ridership on this route is extremely low, and there are many other transit options. He reviewed some of those options, which included Route Nos. 115 and 15L. He reported that 15L has limited stops to downtown.

Route No. 25

Mr. Cheung prefaced the comments on this route by explaining that the people who ride straight through on this route outnumber those who want the loop in Linda Vista to continue. He added that the new Route No. 120L will have limited stops into Fashion Valley and will actually provide the majority of the riders with additional, quicker, and more direct service. He added that Route No. 928 is not changing.

Donna Erickson, Glenda Gaines, Doug Beckham (Linda Vista Civic Ass'n), and Sandra Milne (Linda Vista Mobile Home Park): These speakers opposed the proposed changes to Route No. 25. Ms. Erickson referred to a petition with 777 signatures that was presented at a previous hearing. She stated that the loop through Linda Vista is only one mile long. Ms. Gaines and Ms. Milne objected to the transfer they will have to make. Ms. Gaines stated this transfer will add 30 to 60 minutes to her commute. She requested regular stops on this route, not just express stops. She expressed support for 30-minute frequencies on Route No. 18 and asked that Route No. 81 be restored.

Route No. 70

Ronald Oliver, Kathy Evans-Calderwood (San Diego Welfare Warriors), Kathleen Toscano, Anna Grace Daniels, and Rosa Guerrero: These speakers opposed the recommended changes for this route stating that alternatives are crowded and not fast enough, that there is standing room only at times on this route, and that transfers are very difficult for seniors and the handicapped. Ms. Evans-Calderwood objected to the arbitrary way nature of the changes for disabled, low income, blind, and immigrant ridership. She questioned the veracity of staff's data. Ms. Daniels felt that better marketing should be done in this area to increase ridership.

Ana Covarmbia (CityHeights CDC): Ms. Covarmbia thanked staff for retaining an express route to downtown.

Route No. 28

Terry DiMattio (National Park Service): Mr. DeMattio stated that he is the Superintendent for the light house on Pt. Loma and thanked staff for retaining bus service to Cabrillo National Monument.

Route No. 8

Walt Tice: Mr. Tice opposed the recommended changes to Route No. 8.

Route No. 34

Lee Morton (California Council for the Blind) and Marc Silver (UCSD): Mr. Morton thanked staff for putting COA information on Info Express and for keeping service into south Pt. Loma. Mr. Silva felt this route should run later at night. He also thanked staff for making modifications to Route No. 30 to serve Scripps Institute of Oceanography.

Route No. 35

Brandon Christiansen and Tanya Hickman (Hostelling International): These speakers objected to the recommended changes. Mr. Christiansen stated there are no sidewalks for walking to alternative transit services, and Ms. Hickman stated that most of her guests do not have cars and require later service.

Route Nos. 706/706A

Mr. Mike Daney, Sr. Transportation Planner, explained that the portion of this route that serves Bay Park carries 2.8 passengers per trip, and the portion that serves the mobile home park carries 1 passenger per trip. He stated that there is an annual subsidy of \$337,000 for this route, and 90 percent of the individuals impacted by the recommended changes for this route will have access to other transit routes.

Armando Valenzuela, Andrea LaValley (Chula Vista RV Resort & Marina), Irene Chandler (Canterbury Court), Grace Berthold, Ardis Wiese, Sandra Marsh, Joanna Drouin, and Angela DeLuca: These speakers stressed the importance of this route to seniors and requested that at least some of the service be preserved or that frequencies be reduced instead. Ms. DeLuca stated that, without this route, the community may lose paratransit service also.

Route No. 712

Al Curtis (California Veterans' Home): Mr. Curtis expressed his displeasure with the recommended changes on this route because the California Veterans' Home will not have transit service.

Route No. 702

Richard Bergen: Mr. Bergen expressed his concern about how the recommended changes to this route will affect the children at Hilltop School. He stated that they have no school buses.

Route No. 703

Arthur Gilbert: Mr. Gilbert expressed his concern about how the recommended changes to this route will affect seniors, maids, and nurse assistants.

Route No. 1

Dixie Metcalf and Larry Chaidez (Accessible Services Advisory Committee): Ms. Metcalf stated that the Take Ones about the COA were hard to understand. The speakers said that the recommended changes to this route will cause them to ride a crowded Route No. 25 or they will have to wait longer for Route No. 3.

Route Nos. 5/5A

James Nicoletti (University City Village Apartments), William Clayton, and Diane Bodin: These speakers objected to the changes proposed for Route No. 5/5A. The speakers stated that they

will be forced to consider alternative modes of transportation and requested that MTS consider providing at least limited service. Mr. Clayton stated that bus stops on opposite sides of the street should be visible to each other. Ms. Bodin stated that she will be one mile from the proposed new route. Mr. Nicoletti presented a petition from residents of the University City Village for Seniors requesting continuation of the service on the Kantor Street-Gullstrand corridor.

Route No. 83

Elaine McVey: Ms. McVey requested weekend service into and out of Mission Hills. She commended Mr. Denis Desmond, Sr. Transportation Planner, for replacing their service with a shuttle with improved frequency.

Route No. 30

Jose Melendez: Mr. Melendez suggested limited-stop service on Route Nos. 30 and 844.

Route No. 874

Barbara Steer: Ms. Steer objected to the loss of the north to south transit service in El Cajon.

Route No. 89

Raya Abadir (Windwood Village Apartments): M. Abadir requested that Route No. 89 service be provided to their community, which is rapidly growing, and presented a petition from community residents. He stated that there are many seniors and disabled riders in this area.

General

Gerry Umble: Gerry Umble stated that trolley stop announcements are not always accurate and suggested that the blind be allowed to tell the operator their destination.

Route No. 44

Donald Montgomery: This speaker objected to the distance he will be from a transit stop.

Route No. 89

Sava Rosenfeld: Sava Rosenfeld requested that the proposed Route No. 89 be extended to Carmen Valley (Carmel Canyon Road) – that the closest transit service is five miles.

Route No. 923

Gillian Lancaster: Ms. Lancaster stated that she support the proposed changes for this route. She stated that MTS needs to reach out to school students to teach them about transit. She stated that routes need to have effective connections and requested evening service on Route No. 34.

Route No. 13

Bruce Robbins and Andrew Bailey (Community Activist): Mr. Robbins expressed support for the changes proposed for Route No. 13 and added that he was thankful that he was able to bring his bike along whether riding the bus or trolley. He pointed out that Route No. 14 will not be stopping at the Grantville Trolley Station. Mr. Bailey felt that, overall, the COA lacks sound assessment. He stated that if MTS wants to increase ridership they need to focus on the basics – not televisions on buses and fancy trolley stations.

Route No. 14

Don Stillwell: Mr. Stillwell presented a petition of 600 signatures requesting that the proposed route change for Route No. 14 from Fashion Valley include a stop at Grantville Station on its way both to and from Zion Avenue and Kaiser Hospital. Included in the packet of materials presented by Mr. Stillwell was a letter from a member of the Allied Gardens Community Council and the Navajo Community Planners making the same request.

Mr. Ewin requested that staff provide an explanation at some time in future regarding why Route No. 14 will be not serving the Grantville Trolley Station. He also wondered if this route will be affected by flooding in the San Diego River bed.

Route No. 84

Adrian: Adrian requested weekend service on this route. He stated that facilities along this route are busiest on weekends.

Route No. 851

Ray Scott and Tim Sena: Mr. Scott requested that Route No. 851 provide peak-hour service only. Mr. Sena presented a petition with 150 signatures to retain Route No. 851. Mr. Scott added that he opposed the recommended changes for Route No. 874. He stated that this southbound service is needed.

General

Charlene Ornelus: Ms. Ornelus stated that Route No. 70 buses are full of students in the morning, thanked staff for changes made to Route No. 40, and stated that Route No. 1 needs to go downtown. She also requested that staff look into transfer connections into the Mission Valley area.

Joanne Turnen: Ms. Turnen stated that her commute takes two hours, and it is very hard to make transfers.

Francis (Frank) Cerasoli: Mr. Cerasoli stated that he has to walk 20 minutes to get to the nearest bus route. He stated that improved frequencies are needed. He pointed out that some speakers have suggested higher fares and stated that many transit riders have low incomes. He stated that having a more efficient transit system will increase ridership.

Bertha Klann: Ms. Klann stated that transit service should be more efficient and expeditious.

Submitted Speaker Slips but Elected Not to Speak:

Blas Cedenno – Opposed to recommended changes for Route No. 703.

Don Giaquinto for Council Member Madaffer – Opposed to recommended changes for Route Nos. 13 and 14.

Yung Hsing – Requested weekend late service on Route No. 41.

Oleg Rosenfeld – Requested that Route No. 89 be routed to Carmel Valley Road.

Mark Rudes – Supported MTS Route No. 28 through south Pt. Loma.

Celina Vega – Opposed recommended changes to Route No. 711.

David Youngwood – Opposed to recommended changes to Route No. 20.

Chairman Mathis closed the public testimony portion of this agenda item at 12:24 p.m. and trailed the remainder of the agenda, including Board discussion and action on the COA, to the March 23, 2006 Board meeting.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

30. MTS: Update on the Status of the Grossmont Trolley Station Joint Development Project (LEG 460, PC 50787)

This item was trailed.

REPORT ITEMS

45. This number was not used.

46. MTS: 25th and Commercial/Cesar E. Chavez Station Construction Improvements and Artwork Enhancement (CIP 10740)

This item was trailed.

60. Chairman's Report

There was no discussion of this item.

61. Chief Executive Officer's Report

There was no discussion of this item.

62. Board Member Communications

There were no board member communications

63. Additional Public Comments on Items Not on the Agenda

There were no additional public comments.

64. Next Meeting Date

The next regularly scheduled Board meeting is Thursday, March 23, 2006, at 9:00 a.m. and will be held in Golden Hall.

65. Adjournment

Chairman Mathis adjourned the meeting at 12:25 p.m.

Chairperson
San Diego Metropolitan Transit System
Filed by:

Approved as to form:

Office of the Clerk of the Board
San Diego Metropolitan Transit System

Office of the General Counsel
San Diego Metropolitan Transit System

Attachment: A. Roll Call Sheet
gail.williams/minutes