

JOINT MEETING OF THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS FOR THE  
METROPOLITAN TRANSIT SYSTEM (MTS),  
SAN DIEGO TRANSIT CORPORATION (SDTC), AND  
SAN DIEGO TROLLEY, INC. (SDTI)

March 8, 2006

German American Societies of San Diego, Inc.  
1017 S. Mollison Avenue, El Cajon

MINUTES

A. Roll Call

Chairman Mathis opened the Public Hearing at 6:00 p.m. A roll call sheet listing Board member attendance is attached.

NOTICED PUBLIC HEARINGS

B. Comprehensive Operational Analysis (COA) Service Development Plan

Chairman Mathis welcomed everyone to the Public Hearing. He explained that no action would be taken at this hearing – that action would be taken by the Board at its March 9, 2006 hearing.

MTS Chief Executive Officer (CEO) Paul Jablonski explained that the process was started 18 months ago because MTS has run out of funding to operate the system as it currently exists. He reported that this process involved meeting with many community groups, the transit operators themselves, and advisory groups formed specifically to work on the COA. He stated that over 100 community outreach meetings had been held. He stated that the Board and staff are friends of transit and work as hard as possible to put out as much service as possible with the funding that is available. He stated that the COA condenses the existing system and concentrates services in the more urbanized areas of San Diego and retains the routes that are the most effective and carry the most people. He stated that routes with low productivity were scheduled for adjustment or elimination.

Chairman Mathis provided guidelines for public speakers to follow.

Route No. 854:

*Helen Schlange, Cathy Sykes, Wilma Ward, Kristin Robinson (Unyeway, Inc. Life-Skills Training School), Kathleen Crane, Joy Pruitt, Monica Johnson (TMI, Inc), Susan Zaer, Kim Metli (Unyeway), Becky King, Pat Barber (Unyeway, Inc.) Stella Rhodes (Unyeway, Inc.), Dean Colli (Grossmont College), Mark Robinson, Maria Bono (Unyeway, Inc. Day Program), David Boyle (Unyeway, Inc.), Alan Fisher (Unyeway, Inc.), Janet Carey, Evan Friedman (Student at Grossmont), Patrick Porter, Micheale Traband, and Grace Kennedy:* Each of these speakers objected to the proposed elimination of Route No. 854 because of the impact it will have on their ability and the ability of their clients/students to get around the community and go to school and

work. They also stated that they will have to walk too great a distance to catch the alternative transit service. Other speakers pointed out that there are many physically and mentally challenged individuals and seniors who depend on this service. Some of the speakers stated that they are involved in helping individuals learn to become more independent, and the loss of this service will hamper their efforts to do so. Ms. Ward stated that students of Lakeside Farm Elementary School need this route to get to and from their day programs. Ms. Metli stated that the closest bus stop is over  $\frac{3}{4}$  mile away and will no longer qualify for Americans with Disabilities (ADA) service either. She added that she just signed a five-year lease for their facility, and the loss of Route No. 854 may cause them to close their program. Ms. Barber stated that she had a petition with 820 signatures of people who object to the proposed changes. Mr. Friedman requested that MTS identify a good substitute for Route No. 854.

Mr. Colli spoke about Grossmont College students who utilize transit service and requested that efficiencies be found that do not seriously disadvantage students seeking a better education and life. He stated that Grossmont College will continue to review bus schedules and their interface with start and stop timeframes for their scheduled classes. He stated that the College will also continue to look for ways in which they can partner with MTS to achieve mutual objectives.

Ms. King also objected to the proposed changes to Route Nos. 872, 864, and 858.

#### Staff Response

Mr. Conan Cheung, Director of Planning and Performance Monitoring, talked about the difficulty of this project. He stated that MTS is trying to take out unproductive and duplicative service and put MTS resources where more money can be made, which can then be used to provide more service. He stated that Route No. 854 is one of the least productive routes in the MTS system. He provided a brief overview of its current routing, and reported that the segment being eliminated carries 5 passengers per hour with a subsidy per passenger of \$12.97 compared to a system average of 38.9 passengers at \$1.21 per passenger. He stated that this route carries less than 30 passengers per day. He stated that MTS could consider delaying discontinuation of this loop until January/February 2007 and could work with the SANDAG Coordinated Transportation Services Agency to develop some type of customized community-based service in its place. Mr. Devin Braun, Transit Operations Analyst, pointed out that MTS has already reversed some of its recommended cuts for parts of Route Nos. 832, 833, and 834 in response to community concerns. Mr. Braun, referring to the comments made about service for Grossmont College students, stated that Planning staff conducted a study to determine where the most student demand for transit was originating and recommendations for route changes were made accordingly. Mr. Cheung stated that the Route No. 115 will now travel directly between Grossmont College and San Diego State University (SDSU).

#### Route No. 874

*Judith Liebe, Jennifer Daniels, Julie Zimmerman (Job Coach at Arc-East County Training Center), Rick Smart (Crestwood Apartments), Suzanne McLaughlin, Lucia Garay, and Darlene Nieto:* These individuals spoke about the impact of the recommended service changes on seniors and teens and reported that the alternative transit options will make it more difficult for riders to get around their community. Ms. Zimmerman stated that 100 disabled students at Arc would have to cross Jamacha, a very busy street, or walk blocks on streets with no sidewalks if

the proposed changes are approved. Mr. Smart suggested that planners ride more frequently to get a more accurate count of the number of riders on this route.

Ms. Liebe also objected to changes being proposed for Route Nos. 858 and 873. Ms. Zimmerman requested weekend service on Route No. 816. Ms. McLaughlin suggested that Route No. 864 be taken off the freeway and routed down Broadway to accommodate late riders. She also suggested that Direct-Access Rapid Transit (DART) be brought back.

#### Staff Response

Mr. Cheung stated that staff has already been considering making changes at Lexington and also agreed that there should be additional service on Broadway since it is a major travel corridor. Mr. Cheung added that most of the public speakers live within ¼ mile of the recommended new routes. He stated that a substantial effort to educate the riders of these routes will be undertaken prior to implementation of the recommended changes. He felt that most of the comments made to this point could be addressed through outreach and education.

#### Route No. 855

*Dave DeFields:* Mr. DeFields objected to the proposal to break Route No. 855 into three segments. He stated that he uses this route daily to get to his job at a major corporation. He also stated that this route is not lightly traveled. He stated that there are major businesses at each end of the existing route and objected to being forced to transfer two times to reach his destination.

#### Route No. 856

*Gene Morones (Associate Dean at Cuyamaca College), Joyce Todd, Cindy Estrada (disabled student), Dr. Beth Appenzeller (Ph.D & Acting Vice President, Student Development and Services at Cuyamaca College), Rosalyn Johnson (Cuyamaca College), and Amy Sousa (Cuyamaca College):* Each of these individuals opposed the recommended changes for Route No. 856. Dr. Appenzeller stated that she had talked to Mr. Braun earlier in the week about how the college and MTS could enter into a pilot relationship to increase ridership to the college. She presented a letter addressed to the Board regarding this matter. She requested that MTS not eliminate Saturday service on this route.

Mr. Morones stated that he is advocating for disabled and low-income students who will be disproportionately impacted by the recommended changes to this route. He also requested that MTS not eliminate Saturday service to the college on Route No. 816 and that MTS extend Route No. 962 to the college. Ms. Todd also opposed the recommended changes to Route Nos. 855 and 858. Dr. Appenzeller requested that MTS extend Route No. 962 to Cuyamaca College.

#### Staff Response

Mr. Cheung stated that MTS will continue to monitor all of the proposed changes after implementation and will make adjustments where needed. He explained changes that have already been made to the Route No. 856 recommendation, which will actually enhance the service. He added that Route No. 855 will be maintained basically as is, although it will not go

to Cuyamaca College because Route No. 856 will provide service to the college. He stated that this service will basically mirror the service currently available. He stated that this will result in a small cost increase to MTS and MTS will not be able to guarantee the levels of service.

Route No. 858

*Danniell Van Westerhuyzen:* Mr. Van Westerhuyzen objected to changes in this route as they relate to travel to the college. He expressed concern for bus operators who might lose their jobs.

Staff Response

Mr. Cheung stated that this service is being maintained down Jamacha but is now being called Route No. 816. He added that, under the COA, this route will travel on Main Street instead of Washington, and Route Nos. 874 and 875 will provide service on Washington.

Route No. 851

*Ray Scott:* Mr. Scott suggested that Route No. 851 be run in tandem with Route No. 856 during peak hours. He added that there is no alternative service from Bancroft and Kenwood, where there are many transit-dependent riders.

Route No. 874

*Sonja Rawley, (Arc of San Diego):* Ms. Rawley requested that MTS retain service on a particular portion of Mollison.

Route No. 858

*Arturo Bonavent (Anyway, Inc.), Mike Wasylin (Arc of San Diego East County Training Centers), Charles Elders (Club C.H.I.L.D.), Andrew Johnson, Carrie Schultz, and Akihiko Shinoda:* Each of these speakers objected to the proposed changes for Route No. 858. Mr. Wasylin thanked Mr. Cheung for his clarifications. He also expressed concerns regarding the safety of pedestrians on Jamacha and thanked MTS for keeping the stop at Lexington and Ivory. Mr. Shinoda stated that Route No. 115 is not an effective alternative because it does not go to Johnson and Madison, where there are many student residents. He expressed concern for the safety of female students returning late at night to their homes. He also objected to the fact that Route No. 115 does will not go to Parkway Plaza and added that this route does not run on schedule, which creates additional difficulties.

Mr. Bonavent also opposed changes to Route No. 115 stating that this route should run later than 8:30 p.m. Mr. Elders presented a petition objecting to the proposed changes for Route No. 854.

Route No. 854

*John Turner:* Mr. Turner expressed opposition to the changes proposed for Route No. 854 because he is disabled and needs to go to weekly doctor appointments.

Route No. 833

*Nettie Johnson, Linda White, Lila Smith, Michelle Beathe, and Ryan Burch:* Each of these individuals opposed the recommended changes for Route No. 833 for various reasons including the loss of Saturday/Sunday service, longer walking distance to Broadway, the change from 30-minute to 60-minute frequency, and the additional transfer that will be required to complete a full trip as it currently exists. Ms. White expressed concern for bus operators who might lose their jobs. Ms. Beathe stated that she had gotten 240 signatures on a petition to keep the route as is.

Chairman Mathis assured the speakers that the MTS is trying to serve them as well as many others and has already made changes in response to comments made at previous community meetings. He stated that, in most cases, speakers will still be able to reach their customary destinations although they may have to use a different route number or a different schedule.

Staff Response

Mr. Cheung pointed out that this route ranks 78<sup>th</sup> out of 92 routes and has a subsidy of \$68 per passengers. He stated that this service costs \$60,000 per year to provide, and he didn't feel that MTS would be able to achieve the ridership needed to justify this route. He stated that MTS would have to take funding from another route in order to continue providing service on Route No. 833. Chairman Mathis reported that Los Angeles and San Francisco each provide one cent of their sales tax for transit, and Bay Area Rapid Transit receives another ¼ cent, while San Diego only receives 1/10 of a cent. In response to a question from Mr. Roberts, Mr. Cheung stated that there is no changing of the routing, but that the route is being renumbered, frequency is being reduced, and there will be no weekend service.

Route No. 834

*Jenny Sevick (West Hills High School) and Evalyn Durham:* Ms. Sevick stated that 60 percent of their students use this bus service, and this route is the only one that serves west Santee. She added that Take Ones do not do an adequate job of informing the public and other methods should be used as well. She suggested that staff work directly with the schools. Ms. Durham spoke on behalf of the seniors who use this route. Ms. Durham felt that MTS places a higher priority on getting riders into the downtown area. She felt that everyone should suffer equally when there are service cuts.

Route No. 815

*Kimberly Eakan (Arc of San Diego):* Ms. Eakan expressed opposition on behalf of the disabled and seniors.

Route No. 848

*Ann Prak:* Ms. Prak stated that she moved to her current residence because it was along the route for this bus and expressed her objection to the changes in routing for this bus. She stated that she will be stranded.

Route Nos. 871/872

*Wendi Hutson:* Ms. Hutson expressed her opposition to the recommended changes to this route and explained the impact the changes will have on her autistic child. She stated that she would welcome additional service on Main Street. She stated that her friends don't want to ride the bus. She also stated that it was MTS's job to get the funding needed to provide service to people who are transit dependent.

Route No. 864

*Robert Guthrie:* Mr. Guthrie stated that Route No. 864 should operate on Broadway instead of Madison.

Route No. 855

*Donald Todd:* Mr. Todd stated that there are many areas along this route with no street lights, and bus operators cannot see waiting passengers.

General

*Sandra Harwood:* Ms. Harwood requested that service levels be restored to what they were in 2000. She stated that riders would understand increases in fares even though they may grumble. She presented a petition to save bus routes in east county.

Paratransit

*Nancy Eakon:* Ms. Eakon stated that service cuts should be made equally across the system.

Route Nos. 854, 834, 832 and 833

*Ricky German:* Mr. German opposed recommended changes to these routes. He stated that the changes will negatively impact riders who work on weekends, are in wheelchairs, go to work, etc. He stated that some riders will have to take five to six different buses to get to their destinations.

General

*Robert Ricks:* Mr. Ricks stated that he had gotten 440 signatures in 7 days on a petition objecting to east county service changes. (No petition was presented.) He stated that these changes are ruining lives. He was particularly concerned about Route No. 854.

Mr. Cheung stated that Route No. 854 currently carries only five passengers per hour at a subsidy of \$12.97 per passengers, which is less than 30 people all day. Mr. Cheung was requested to recheck his figures.

*Kathy Buckmaster:* Ms. Buckmaster objected to the recommended service changes for east county. She stated that riders are particularly concerned about Route No. 833. She stated that riders will lose their jobs if they do not have weekend transit service. She also stated that 60-

minute frequency is not enough. She felt that MTS has a responsibility to ensure the safety and well being of its riders.

*Jerry Barber (East County Action Network):* Mr. Barber stated that he was speaking on behalf of ADA riders who are transit dependent. He stated that not all routes can be made financially viable. He suggested that MTS look at the entire system and market in areas where more ridership is needed. He also suggested that MTS discuss route issues with its bus operators.

*Anne Burress:* Ms. Burress talked about the hardships of people who use the buses and suggested that MTS evaluate its service on the basis of who is using the bus and what their needs are.

#### Route No. 854

*Linda Weaver:* Ms. Weaver stated that Route No. 854 is a lifeline into Santee. She stated that this route carries more than five people per hour. She suggested that this route be limited to peak hours instead of cutting it altogether.

#### General

*Linda Bryan:* Ms. Bryan spoke on behalf of disabled people. She stated that MTS should be more cognizant of the special difficulties that disabled people have. She stated that disabled riders have a more difficult time understanding changes.

#### Route Nos. 4, 11, and 936

*Lorraine Leighton:* Ms. Leighton stated that she disagreed with the alignments of Route Nos. 4, 11, and 936 in Spring Valley. She also spoke about disabled access on Lexington. She applauded all the riders who took time to come to the public hearing. She stated that there are no schedules posted except at major points. She suggested that staff take salary cuts and consult with operators who drive the bus as part of a closer look at the COA recommendations.

The Public Hearing was closed at 8:57 p.m.

#### C. PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no additional public comments.

#### 64. Next Public Hearing Date

The next Public Hearing is scheduled for March 9, 2006 at 9:00 a.m. in Golden Hall at 202 C Street in San Diego.

#### 65. Adjournment

Chairman Mathis adjourned the meeting at 8:58 p.m.

---

Chairperson  
San Diego Metropolitan Transit System  
Filed by:

Approved as to form:

---

Office of the Clerk of the Board  
San Diego Metropolitan Transit System

---

Office of the General Counsel  
San Diego Metropolitan Transit System

Attachment: A. Roll Call Sheet  
gail.williams/minutes